



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES  
IN LINGUISTICS 10

# **Transformational Grammar as a Theory of Language Acquisition**

A Study in the Empirical, Conceptual  
and Methodological Foundations of  
Contemporary Linguistic Theory

**BRUCE L. DERWING**

**CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS**

# Contents

---

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page ix</i>
PART I BACKGROUND	
1 Introduction	3
1.1 Purpose of the study	3
1.2 Rationale for the study	5
1.3 Some problems of strategy	9
1.3.1 On Kuhn's notion of the paradigm	9
1.3.2 On the role of criticism in science	12
1.3.3 Some special problems in dealing with paradigms	14
1.3.4 The method of alternative hypotheses	16
1.4 Overview	20
2 Some central aspects of the 'Chomskyan revolution' in American linguistics	25
2.1 Some signs of revolutionary struggle	25
2.2 On the nature of language	27
2.3 On the purpose of linguistic description	30
2.4 On the data of linguistics	40
2.5 Summary and conclusions	42
3 On the nature of language acquisition	44
3.1 An inductive requirement on grammars	44
3.2 Chomsky's model of language acquisition	50
3.3 An alternative model of the AD	53
3.4 Some background considerations	56
3.5 Are innate linguistic universals really necessary?	63
3.6 Some implicit dangers	77
3.7 Summary and conclusions	83

PART II LINGUISTIC METATHEORY		<i>page</i>
4	Some problems in phonological description	87
4.1	Selecting the problem	87
4.2	The <i>ov</i> ~ <i>uj</i> alternation in Russian	91
4.3	The case <i>for</i> the generative treatment	95
4.4	On learning abstract lexical representations	100
4.5	The case <i>against</i> the generative treatment	107
4.5.1	Arguments of descriptive adequacy	107
4.5.2	Arguments of synchronic legitimacy	112
4.5.2.1	On the use of diachronic information in synchronic description	113
4.5.2.2	The Chomsky-Halle-Kiparsky- Postal theory of language change	115
4.5.2.3	Weinreich, Labov and Herzog's criticisms and counterproposals	119
4.5.3	The problem of lexical identity	122
4.5.4	Other anomalies of generative phonology	126
5	'Explanation' and 'naturalness' in TGG	130
5.1	On 'explanation' and 'regularity' in generative phonology	130
5.2	On 'simplicity' and 'naturalness' in generative phonology	135
5.3	A brief syntactic interlude	155
5.4	A recapitulation	167
6	Some process-oriented counterproposals	169
6.1	Aspects of Chomsky's crusade against the phoneme	169
6.2	A tentative set of 'learnability' constraints on phonological systems	188
6.3	Summary and conclusions	218
PART III METHODOLOGICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FOUNDATIONS		
7	Chomsky's 'revolution' reconsidered	225
7.1	On the nature of scientific discovery	225

7.1.1	Is there a logic of discovery?	page 226
7.1.2	<i>The steps to theory</i>	230
7.2	On justifying theories	236
7.2.1	On confirming and falsifying theories	236
7.2.2	On prediction and explanation in science and in TGG	239
7.2.3	On simplicity	243
7.3	On the use of introspective evidence in TGG	247
7.4	On idealization in science and in TGG	251
8	On 'competence' and 'performance'	259
8.1	Three interpretations of Chomsky's competence/ performance distinction	259
8.1.1	Competence as an idealized model of linguistic performance	259
8.1.2	Competence as a central component of an idealized performance model	270
8.1.3	Competence as an independent abstract entity remote from linguistic performance	281
8.2	The transformational-generative paradigm: an overall assessment	296
9	Towards a redefinition of linguistic research	301
9.1	What is linguistics?	301
9.1.1	A schematic model of the language process	302
9.1.2	Linguistics or 'psycholinguistics'?	304
9.2	On the initial contributions of formal linguistics and experimental psychology	307
9.2.1	Some fundamental linguistic concepts	308
9.2.2	An illustrative research paradigm from experimental psychology	316
9.3	A concluding summary and prognosis	321
	<i>Bibliography</i>	325
	<i>Index</i>	342