




BLACKWELL  
PHILOSOPHY  
ANTHOLOGIES

Edited by  
HELGA KUHSE AND PETER SINGER

# Bioethics

An Anthology

**Second Edition**

 Blackwell  
Publishing

# Contents

Acknowledgments	xii
Introduction	1
<b>Part I Before Birth</b>	<b>9</b>
Introduction	11
<b>Abortion</b>	<b>15</b>
1 Abortion and Health Care Ethics JOHN FINNIS	17
2 Abortion and Infanticide MICHAEL TOOLEY	25
3 A Defense of Abortion JUDITH JARVIS THOMSON	40
4 Why Abortion is Immoral DON MARQUIS	51
<b>Mother–Fetus Conflict</b>	<b>63</b>
5 Are Pregnant Women Fetal Containers? LAURA M. PURDY	65
<b>Part II Issues in Reproduction</b>	<b>77</b>
Introduction	79
<b>Assisted Reproduction</b>	<b>85</b>
6 The McCaughey Septuplets: God’s Will or Human Choice? GREGORY E. PENCE	87

## Contents

7	Surrogate Mothering: Exploitation or Empowerment?	90
	LAURA M. PURDY	
8	A Response to Purdy	100
	SUSAN DODDS AND KAREN JONES	
9	The Right to Lesbian Parenthood	104
	GILLIAN HANSCOMBE	
10	Rights, Interests, and Possible People	108
	DEREK PARFIT	
<b>Prenatal Screening, Sex Selection, and Cloning</b>		<b>113</b>
11	Genetics and Reproductive Risk: Can Having Children be Immoral?	115
	LAURA M. PURDY	
12	Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion: A Challenge to Practice and Policy	122
	ADRIENNE ASCH	
13	Genetic Technology: A Threat to Deafness	137
	RUTH CHADWICK AND MAIRI LEVITT	
14	Sex Selection: The Case For	145
	JULIAN SAVULESCU	
15	Conception to Obtain Hematopoietic Stem Cells	150
	JOHN A. ROBERTSON, JEFFREY P. KAHN, AND JOHN E. WAGNER	
16	Why We Should Not Permit Embryos to be Selected as Tissue Donors	158
	DAVID KING	
17	The Moral Status of the Cloning of Humans	162
	MICHAEL TOOLEY	
<b>Part III The New Genetics</b>		<b>179</b>
Introduction		181
<b>Gene Therapy and Eugenics</b>		<b>185</b>
18	Questions About Some Uses of Genetic Engineering	187
	JONATHAN GLOVER	
19	Ethical Issues in Manipulating the Human Germ Line	198
	MARC LAPPÉ	
20	The Moral Significance of the Therapy-Enhancement Distinction in Human Genetics	209
	DAVID B. RESNIK	
21	Should We Undertake Genetic Research on Intelligence?	219
	AINSLEY NEWSON AND ROBERT WILLIAMSON	

<b>Genetic Screening and Counseling</b>	<b>229</b>
22 Lessons from a Dark and Distant Past	231
BENNO MÜLLER-HILL	
23 Patient Autonomy and Value-Neutrality in Nondirective Genetic Counseling	237
ROBERT WACHBROIT AND DAVID WASSERMAN	
24 Genetic Dilemmas and the Child's Right to an Open Future	246
DENA S. DAVIS	
<b>Part IV Life and Death Issues</b>	<b>257</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>259</b>
25 The Sanctity of Life	266
JONATHAN GLOVER	
26 Declaration on Euthanasia	276
SACRED CONGREGATION FOR THE DOCTRINE OF THE FAITH	
<b>Killing and Letting Die</b>	<b>281</b>
27 The Morality of Killing: A Traditional View	283
GERMAIN GRISEZ AND JOSEPH M. BOYLE, JR.	
28 Active and Passive Euthanasia	288
JAMES RACHELS	
29 Is Killing No Worse Than Letting Die?	292
WINSTON NESBITT	
30 Why Killing is Not Always Worse – and Sometimes Better – Than Letting Die	297
HELGA KUHSE	
<b>Severely Disabled Newborns</b>	<b>301</b>
31 When Care Cannot Cure: Medical Problems in Seriously Ill Babies	303
NEIL CAMPBELL	
32 A Modern Myth: That Letting Die is Not the Intentional Causation of Death	315
HELGA KUHSE	
33 The Abnormal Child: Moral Dilemmas of Doctors and Parents	329
R. M. HARE	
34 Right to Life of Handicapped	334
ALISON DAVIS	
<b>Brain Death</b>	<b>337</b>
35 A Definition of Irreversible Coma	339
REPORT OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE OF THE HARVARD MEDICAL SCHOOL TO EXAMINE THE DEFINITION OF BRAIN DEATH	

## Contents

36	Is the Sanctity of Life Ethic Terminally Ill? PETER SINGER	344
<b>Advance Directives</b>		<b>355</b>
37	Life Past Reason RONALD DWORKIN	357
38	Dworkin on Dementia: Elegant Theory, Questionable Policy REBECCA DRESSER	365
<b>Voluntary Euthanasia and Medically Assisted Suicide</b>		<b>375</b>
39	The Note CHRIS HILL	377
40	When Self-Determination Runs Amok DANIEL CALLAHAN	381
41	When Abstract Moralizing Runs Amok JOHN LACHS	386
42	Listening and Helping to Die: The Dutch Way PIETER ADMIRAAL	391
<b>Part V Resource Allocation</b>		<b>399</b>
Introduction		401
<b>Micro-Allocation: Deciding Between Patients</b>		<b>405</b>
43	Rescuing Lives: Can't We Count? PAUL T. MENZEL	407
44	The Allocation of Exotic Medical Lifesaving Therapy NICHOLAS RESCHER	410
45	Should Alcoholics Compete Equally for Liver Transplantation? ALVIN H. MOSS AND MARK SIEGLER	421
46	The Value of Life JOHN HARRIS	428
47	How Age Should Matter: Justice as the Basis for Limiting Care to the Elderly ROBERT M. VEATCH	437
<b>Macro-Allocation: Dividing Up the Healthcare Budget</b>		<b>449</b>
48	Quality of Life and Resource Allocation MICHAEL LOCKWOOD	451

49	A Lifespan Approach to Health Care NORMAN DANIELS	465
<b>Part VI Organ Donation</b>		<b>475</b>
Introduction		477
50	Why Give to Strangers? RICHARD M. TITMUS	479
51	Organ Donation and Retrieval: Whose Body is it Anyway? EIKE-HENNER W. KLUGE	483
52	The Case for Allowing Kidney Sales JANET RADCLIFFE-RICHARDS ET AL.	487
53	The Survival Lottery JOHN HARRIS	491
<b>Part VII Experimentation with Human Subjects</b>		<b>497</b>
Introduction		499
<b>Human Subjects</b>		<b>503</b>
54	Ethics and Clinical Research HENRY K. BEECHER	505
55	Equipoise and the Ethics of Clinical Research BENJAMIN FREEDMAN	513
56	The Patient and the Public Good SAMUEL HELLMAN	520
57	The Morality of Clinical Research: A Case Study TORBJÖRN TÄNNSJÖ	525
58	Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing Countries PETER LURIE AND SIDNEY M. WOLFE	533
59	We're Trying to Help Our Sickest People, Not Exploit Them DANSTAN BAGENDA AND PHILIPPA MUSOKE-MUDIDO	539
<b>Human Embryos – Stem Cells</b>		<b>541</b>
60	Question of Respect for Life: What Some [Australian] Members of Parliament Have Said About Embryonic Stem Cell Research in Parliament This Week	543
61	Stem Cells, Sex, and Procreation JOHN HARRIS	545

<b>Part VIII</b>	<b>Experimentation with Animals</b>	<b>559</b>
	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>561</b>
62	Duties Towards Animals IMMANUEL KANT	564
63	A Utilitarian View JEREMY BENTHAM	566
64	All Animals are Equal PETER SINGER	568
65	Vivisection, Morals and Medicine: An Exchange R. G. FREY AND SIR WILLIAM PATON	578
<b>Part IX</b>	<b>Ethical Issues in the Practice of Healthcare</b>	<b>589</b>
	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>591</b>
	<b>Confidentiality</b>	<b>595</b>
66	Confidentiality in Medicine: A Decrepit Concept MARK SIEGLER	597
	<b>Truth-Telling</b>	<b>601</b>
67	On a Supposed Right to Lie from Altruistic Motives IMMANUEL KANT	603
68	Should Doctors Tell the Truth? JOSEPH COLLINS	605
69	On Telling Patients the Truth ROGER HIGGS	611
	<b>Informed Consent and Patient Autonomy</b>	<b>619</b>
70	On Liberty JOHN STUART MILL	621
71	From <i>Schloendorff v. New York Hospital</i> JUSTICE BENJAMIN N. CARDOZO	624
72	Amputees by Choice CARL ELLIOTT	625
73	Abandoning Informed Consent ROBERT M. VEATCH	636
74	Rational Desires and the Limitation of Life-Sustaining Treatment JULIAN SAVULESCU	646

75	The Doctor–Patient Relationship in Different Cultures	664
	RUTH MACKLIN	
<b>Part X</b>	<b>Special Issues Facing Nurses</b>	<b>677</b>
	Introduction	679
76	Ethical Dilemmas for Nurses: Physicians' Orders Versus Patients' Rights	682
	E. JOY KROEGER MAPPES	
77	In Defense of the Traditional Nurse	690
	LISA H. NEWTON	
<b>Part XI</b>	<b>Ethicists and Ethics Committees</b>	<b>699</b>
	Introduction	701
78	When Philosophers Shoot from the Hip	703
	JAMES RACHELS	
79	Ethics Consultation as Moral Engagement	707
	JONATHAN D. MORENO	
80	Truth or Consequences: The Role of Philosophers in Policy-Making	715
	DAN W. BROCK	
81	Should the Decisions of Ethics Committees be Based on Community Values?	719
	HETA HÄYRY	
	Index	725